

Formal Logic
Fall 2018: Test 3—Answers

Part 1: Translate the following into symbolic form. (5 points each.)

1. No one is dangerous, if some logician has long hair.

$$((\exists x)(Lx \cdot Hx) \supset \sim(\exists x)Dx) \quad \text{or} \quad ((\exists x)(Lx \cdot Hx) \supset (x)\sim Dx)$$

2. Baldner isn't a logician, but he does have long hair.

$$(\sim Lb \cdot Hb)$$

3. If anyone is dangerous, then Baldner is dangerous.

$$((\exists x)Dx \supset Db) \quad \text{or} \quad (x)(Dx \supset Db)$$

4. Not all who aren't logicians have long hair.

$$\sim(x)(\sim Lx \supset Hx)$$

5. If not everyone is dangerous, then not everyone has long hair.

$$(\sim(x)Dx \supset \sim(x)Hx) \quad \text{or} \quad ((\exists x)\sim Dx \supset (\exists x)\sim Hx)$$

6. Not any who are logicians aren't dangerous.

$$\sim(\exists x)(Lx \cdot \sim Dx) \quad \text{or} \quad (x)(Lx \supset Dx)$$

Part 2: Construct a proof or refutation of the following arguments, using the inference rules and strategies developed in Chapter 8 of our text. As before, when the rules tell you to erase double-star strings, circle them instead. (As before, in these answers, I will indicate erased stars in red, e.g., ******.) And don't forget to construct a refutation box if you refute the argument. (10 points each.)

1.

- | | | |
|------|---|----------|
| 1. | $(x)\sim Sx$ | |
| *2. | $\sim(\exists x)\sim Ex$ | |
| 3. | $\sim Hc$ | |
| | $[\therefore(\exists x)\sim(\sim(\sim Ex \vee Hx) \supset Sx)]$ | |
| *4. | $[\text{ASM } \sim(\exists x)\sim(\sim(\sim Ex \vee Hx) \supset Sx)]$ | |
| 5. | $ (x)Ex$ | 2 |
| 6. | $ (x)(\sim(\sim Ex \vee Hx) \supset Sx)$ | 4 |
| 7. | $ \sim Sc$ | 1 |
| 8. | $ Ec$ | 5 |
| *9. | $ \sim(\sim(\sim Ec \vee Hc) \supset Sc)$ | 6 |
| *10. | $ (\sim Ec \vee Hc)$ | 7, 9 |
| 11. | $ Hc$ | 8, 10 |
| 12. | $(\exists x)\sim(\sim(\sim Ex \vee Hx) \supset Sx)$ | 4: 3, 11 |

VALID

2.a [second assumption: $(\exists x)Jx$]

- | | | |
|------|---|-----------|
| 1. | $(\sim(\exists x)Jx \supset (\exists x)Nx)$ | |
| | $[\therefore(x)(Jx \vee Nx)]$ | |
| *2. | $\text{ASM } \sim(x)(Jx \vee Nx)$ | |
| *3. | $(\exists x)\sim(Jx \vee Nx)$ | 2 |
| *4. | $\sim(Ja \vee Na)$ | 3 |
| 5. | $\sim Ja$ | 4 |
| 6. | $\sim Na$ | 4 |
| **7. | $\text{ASM } (\exists x)Jx$ | {break 1} |
| 8. | Jb | 7 |

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ja, \sim Na, Jb$

2.b [second assumption: $\sim(\exists x)Jx$]

**1.	$(\sim(\exists x)Jx \supset (\exists x)Nx)$	
	$[\therefore (x)(Jx \vee Nx)]$	
*2.	ASM $\sim(x)(Jx \vee Nx)$	
*3.	$(\exists x)\sim(Jx \vee Nx)$	2
*4.	$\sim(Ja \vee Na)$	3
5.	$\sim Ja$	4
6.	$\sim Na$	4
**7.	ASM $\sim(\exists x)Jx$	{break 1}
**8.	$(\exists x)Nx$	1, 7
9.	Nb	8
10.	$(x)\sim Jx$	7
11.	$\sim Jb$	10

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ja, \sim Na, Nb, \sim Jb$

2.c [second assumption: $(\exists x)Nx$]

1.	$(\sim(\exists x)Jx \supset (\exists x)Nx)$	
	$[\therefore (x)(Jx \vee Nx)]$	
*2.	ASM $\sim(x)(Jx \vee Nx)$	
*3.	$(\exists x)\sim(Jx \vee Nx)$	2
*4.	$\sim(Ja \vee Na)$	3
5.	$\sim Ja$	4
6.	$\sim Na$	4
**7.	ASM $(\exists x)Nx$	{break 1}
8.	Nb	7

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ja, \sim Na, Nb$

2.d [second assumption: $\sim(\exists x)Nx$]

**1.	$(\sim(\exists x)Jx \supset (\exists x)Nx)$	
	[$\therefore (x)(Jx \vee Nx)$]	
*2.	ASM $\sim(x)(Jx \vee Nx)$	
*3.	$(\exists x)\sim(Jx \vee Nx)$	2
*4.	$\sim(Ja \vee Na)$	3
5.	$\sim Ja$	4
6.	$\sim Na$	4
**7.	ASM $\sim(\exists x)Nx$	{break 1}
**8.	$(\exists x)Jx$	1, 7
9.	Jb	8
10.	$(x)\sim Nx$	7
11.	$\sim Nb$	10

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ja, \sim Na, Jb, \sim Nb$

3.

*1.	$\sim(\sim(\exists x)\sim Hx \supset \sim(\exists x)Jx)$	
2.	$(x)(\sim Sx \supset \sim Hx)$	
	[$\therefore \sim(x)(Jx \supset \sim Sx)$]	
3.	[ASM $(x)(Jx \supset \sim Sx)$]	
*4.	$ \sim(\exists x)\sim Hx$	1
*5.	$ \sim(\exists x)Jx$	1
6.	$ (x)Hx$	4
7.	$ Ja$	5
*8.	$ \sim Sa \supset \sim Ha$	2
*9.	$ (Ja \supset \sim Sa)$	3
10.	$ \sim Sa$	7, 9
11.	$ \sim Ha$	8, 10
12.	$ Ha$	6
13.	$\sim(x)(Jx \supset \sim Sx)$	3: 11, 12

VALID

4.

1.	$(x)\sim Px$	
*2.	$(\sim(x)Jx \cdot (x)Ex)$	
	$[\therefore \sim(\exists x)\sim(\sim(Jx \vee Px) \cdot Ex)]$	
*3.	ASM $(\exists x)\sim(\sim(Jx \vee Px) \cdot Ex)$	
*4.	$\sim(x)Jx$	2
5.	$(x)Ex$	2
*6.	$\sim(\sim(Ja \vee Pa) \cdot Ea)$	3
*7.	$(\exists x)\sim Jx$	4
8.	$\sim Jb$	7
9.	$\sim Pa$	1
10.	$\sim Pb$	1
11.	Ea	5
*12.	$(Ja \vee Pa)$	6, 11
13.	Ja	9, 12
14.	Eb	5

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Jb, \sim Pa, \sim Pb, Ja, Ea, Eb$

5.a [second assumption: $(x)Mx$]

*1.	$\sim(\sim(x)Mx \cdot \sim(\exists x)\sim Ux)$	
	$[\therefore \sim(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)]$	
*2.	ASM $(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)$	
*3.	$(\sim Ma \cdot Ua)$	2
4.	$\sim Ma$	3
5.	Ua	3
6.	[ASM $(x)Mx$	{break 1}
7.	[Ma	6
*8.	$\sim(x)Mx$	6: 4, 7
9.	$(\exists x)\sim Mx$	8
*10.	$(\exists x)\sim Ux$	1, 8
11.	$\sim Ub$	10

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ma, Ua, \sim Ub$

5.b [second assumption: $\sim(x)Mx$]

- **1. $\sim(\sim(x)Mx \cdot \sim(\exists x)\sim Ux)$
 $[\therefore \sim(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)]$
- *2. ASM $(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)$
- *3. $(\sim Ma \cdot Ua)$ 2
4. $\sim Ma$ 3
5. Ua 3
- **6. ASM $\sim(x)Mx$ {break 1}
- **7. $(\exists x)\sim Ux$ 1, 6
8. $\sim Ub$ 7
9. $(\exists x)\sim Mx$ 6

REFUTE a, b, c: $\sim Ma, Ua, \sim Ub$

5.c [second assumption: $\sim(\exists x)\sim Ux$]

- **1. $\sim(\sim(x)Mx \cdot \sim(\exists x)\sim Ux)$
 $[\therefore \sim(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)]$
- *2. ASM $(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)$
- *3. $(\sim Ma \cdot Ua)$ 2
4. $\sim Ma$ 3
5. Ua 3
6. [ASM $\sim(\exists x)\sim Ux$ {break 1}
7. $|(x)Mx$ 1, 6
8. [Ma 7
- *9. $(\exists x)\sim Ux$ 6: 4, 8
10. $\sim Ub$ 9

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ma, Ua, \sim Ub$

5.d [second assumption: $(\exists x)\sim Ux$]

- | | | |
|------|--|-----------|
| 1. | $\sim(\sim(x)Mx \cdot \sim(\exists x)\sim Ux)$ | |
| | [$\therefore \sim(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)$] | |
| *2. | ASM $(\exists x)(\sim Mx \cdot Ux)$ | |
| *3. | $(\sim Ma \cdot Ua)$ | 2 |
| 4. | $\sim Ma$ | 3 |
| 5. | Ua | 3 |
| **6. | ASM $(\exists x)\sim Ux$ | {break 1} |
| 7. | $\sim Ub$ | 6 |

REFUTE a, b: $\sim Ma, Ua, \sim Ub$

6.a [second assumption: $\sim(\exists x)Ex$]

- | | | |
|------|--|-----------|
| *1. | $\sim((\exists x)Ex \cdot \sim(x)\sim Qx)$ | |
| | [$\therefore \sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$] | |
| *2. | [ASM $(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$] | |
| *3. | $ \sim(Qa \supset \sim Ea)$ | 2 |
| 4. | $ Qa$ | 3 |
| 5. | $ Ea$ | 3 |
| **6. | $ $ [ASM $\sim(\exists x)Ex$] | {break 1} |
| 7. | $ $ $ (x)\sim Ex$ | 6 |
| 8. | $ $ $ \sim Ea$ | 7 |
| 9. | $ \sim(\exists x)Ex$ | 6: 5, 8 |
| 10. | $ (x)\sim Qx$ | 1, 9 |
| 11. | $ \sim Qa$ | 10 |
| 12. | $\sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$ | 2: 4, 11 |

VALID

6.b [second assumption: $(\exists x)Ex$]

**1.	$\sim((\exists x)Ex \cdot \sim(x)\sim Qx)$	
	$[\therefore \sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)]$	
*2.	[ASM $(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$	
*3.	$\sim(Qa \supset \sim Ea)$	2
4.	Qa	3
5.	Ea	3
6.	[ASM $(\exists x)Ex$	{break 1}
7.	$(x)\sim Qx$	1, 6
8.	$\lceil \sim Qa$	7
*9.	$\sim(\exists x)Ex$	6: 4, 8
10.	$(x)\sim Ex$	9
11.	$\lceil \sim Ea$	10
12.	$\sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$	2: 5, 11

VALID

6.c [second assumption: $\sim(x)\sim Qx$]

**1.	$\sim((\exists x)Ex \cdot \sim(x)\sim Qx)$	
	$[\therefore \sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)]$	
*2.	[ASM $(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$	
*3.	$\sim(Qa \supset \sim Ea)$	2
4.	Qa	3
5.	Ea	3
6.	[ASM $\sim(x)\sim Qx$	{break 1}
**7.	$\sim(\exists x)Ex$	1, 6
8.	$(x)\sim Ex$	7
9.	$\lceil \sim Ea$	8
10.	$(x)\sim Qx$	6: 5, 9
11.	$\lceil \sim Qa$	10
12.	$\sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$	2: 4, 11

VALID

6.d [second assumption: $(x)\sim Qx$]

*1.	$\sim((\exists x)Ex \cdot \sim(x)\sim Qx)$	
	[$\therefore \sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$]	
*2.	[ASM $(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$]	
*3.	$ \sim(Qa \supset \sim Ea)$	2
4.	$ Qa$	3
5.	$ Ea$	3
6.	$ $ [ASM $(x)\sim Qx$]	{break 1}
7.	$ $ [$\sim Qa$]	6
8.	$ \sim(x)\sim Qx$	6: 4, 7
*9.	$ \sim(\exists x)Ex$	1, 8
10.	$ (x)\sim Ex$	9
11.	$ \sim Ea$	10
12.	$\sim(\exists x)\sim(Qx \supset \sim Ex)$	2: 5, 11

VALID**7.**

*1.	$(\sim(\exists x)\sim Sx \cdot (\exists x)Nx)$	
	[$\therefore \sim(x)\sim(Nx \cdot Sx)$]	
2.	[ASM $(x)\sim(Nx \cdot Sx)$]	
*3.	$ \sim(\exists x)\sim Sx$	1
*4.	$ \sim(\exists x)Nx$	1
5.	$ (x)Sx$	3
6.	$ Na$	4
*7.	$ \sim(Na \cdot Sa)$	2
8.	$ \sim Sa$	6,7
9.	$ Sa$	5
10.	$\sim(x)\sim(Nx \cdot Sx)$	2: 8, 9

VALID