In his *History of the Inductive Sciences*, 3rd ed., vol. 2 (New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1858), p. 192, William Whewell laments the indistinctness of ideas in the middle ages, writing that the men of those times did not possess the notions, even of space and number, in that vivid and vigorous manner which enables them to discover new truths. If they had perceived distinctly that the astronomical theorist had merely to do with *relative* motions, they must have been led to see the possibility, at least, of the Copernican system; . . . We find no trace of this.

Using material we have read this semester, refute Whewell’s claim. Be sure to give clear references to the sources you cite or quote. Be sure to indicate how a medieval thinker considering the possibility of the Earth’s motion might address the key Aristotelian argument developed by Ptolemy in the *Almagest* *against* the motion of the Earth.

Your typed, double spaced essay, which should be approximately three pages long (1 inch margins, 12 point font, Times New Roman), is due at the beginning of class on Thursday, October 13, 2011. Staple this sheet to the front and (if and only if you can honestly do so) sign your name in the box below.

I certify that this essay is my own work and that I have neither sought nor received any help on it except what has been explicitly authorized by Dr. McGrew.